195 43-44 **File No.** 2455/36-II

A CLASS P. W. **DEPARTMENT**

E **BRANCH**

Subject:— Grant of S.E's Powers to C.P.H.E Status — Consulting Public Health Engr. to Govt:— orders reg.

A [K]

V

E.B.

File No. 2455/36-II

Etd, Sectt. Slip. 24 A

G.R., G.D., No. 2408, dated 22-6-22.]

Correspondence

DOCKET SHEET

Subject :—

File No. 2455/36-II

P.W **DEPT.**

E **BRANCH.**

References :—

Date.	To whom sent.	Notes and instructions.

No. 8/55 of 1943.

From

H.A. Collett, Esquire M.B.E., F.R. San.I
CONSULTING PUBLIC HEALTH ENGINEER TO GOVERNMENT
BOMBAY

Post Box No. 39 Poona.

To:

The Secretary to Government,
Public Works Department, Bombay,

Poona 6th August 1943.

Subject: Public Health Branch.

Sir,

During interviews I have had last month with the Advisers to H.E. the Governor and some of the Secretaries to Government I was surprised to be asked whether the office of the consulting public Health Engineer did any construction work. The general impression was that we were only a consulting office giving technical advice to municipalities and departments of Government. I have therefore had ~~had~~ the attached chart prepared which I hope you will kindly circulate to the other Secretaries and Advisers. The chart shows that during the year 1942-43 my office and its attached sub-divns. has carried out-

i) Original works to the value of Rs 19.3 lakhs.
ii) Supervision of maintenance and re-
-pairs works amounting to Rs 7.0 "
iii) Collecting Government rev-
enue to the value of over and 13.5 "
iv) Holding a stock to the value
of over Rs 3-0 "
Total Rs 42.8 lakhs.

The work of my office is now supervising the work of three previous executive engineers-viz (i) Executive Engineer, Boring Works Division(2) Executive Mechanical Eggineer, Dapuri Central Stores and workshops and (3) Executive Engineer, Poona, Water-

and (3) Executive Engineer, Poona Water works Division-in addition to its own duties as consulting Public Healty Engineer and advising onwater supply and sanitation to the Bombay Government and on the purchase, errection and maintenance of all water and drainage installations in the province ~~xxxx

long experience. During the last three years of the war I have been able to help the Defence Deptt. very considerably and they have acknowledge my help gratefully. The actual work was advising with regard to the construction of weirs accross rivers so as to impound water for troops in out station and buildings of filters reserviors etc. I was also requested to design a new type of filter which is a cross between complated a slow sand and rapid filter. Five of these filters have already been completed by the MES one for the Pimpri Dairy Farm for 3000 buffaloes, one for Dehu Road, another for Khadakwasla Camp and two for the troops in Belgaum . These filters are of an elementary desighn with no machinery or completed parts and are producing excellent sterile water at a moderate cost. I intend to improve these filter and to make them suitable for use in villages and small towns. Lately I have also advised a certain municipality to alter the working of their settling tanks and to add small structural improvements. I am glad to state that they asked me to do this and the practical results is that this Muny. has been able to get clear water and to save an expenditure of Rs 30,000 on alum alone during four months working.I have lately received a letter from the President of this Municipality acknowledging my help in this matter. There are many other cases where I have been able to be of considerable use with practical advice in water supply and sanitation and I mention these to show that if I could be relieved of excessive routine I would have more time to spend on suggested improvements to public health works and new designs and this beof more assistance to th Bombay Government.

and it is believed that a change in the designation of this office.

This office has the confidence of municipalities and others as suggested above would be of great help, especially as I have to deal with the supervision of public health-----

alth works carried out by my brother executive engineers.

Exfepting sinde all other Provinces in India support Public Health Engineer of a superintending engineer tus or of a higher status.

ID

Consulting Public Health.

Engineer to Government.

nclo. 1 chart (in duplicate)

B

Submitted for secy's information in the first instance. In necessary note on the C.P.H.E.'s proposals will be at up later.

Id/10/8/43

Will the office please note on the various points ised aried by the C.P.H.E. in this letter of his.

ID. 17-8-43.

In the circumstances explained in the C.P.H. E to Govt. mainly requests.

a) that the office of the C.P.H.E. to Govt. may be re-stored to its former S.E. status.

b) that one executive division be sanctioned for poona water works.

2. Point (a) The C.P.H. E. is repeatedly making a request that he may be given the powers of a S.E..This question was fully discussed at great length -vide O. N. dated the 23 -8-39 and the Dy. Secy's(Mr. Hammett's) note dated the 24-8-39 , In the O.N. refered to above full history of the P.H. Branch is given .The C.P.H.E. was informed that Govt. saw no reason to invest him with the powers of a S.E. vide G.M.No.1731/36-E dated the 2-9-1939.

3. Please see para. 5 of the note of A (F) dated the 12-6-42 on file No. 5952/36 regarding the Sholapur Water Supply. It will be seen therefrom that A(F) is not in favour of giving a S.E.'s status to the C.P. H.E. The execution of the work of improvement to the Sholapur Water Works was entrusted to the C.P.H.E. as a special case inview of the minute of H.E. dated the 17-6-42.It was however decided that this should not be created as a precedent.

4. At present the C.P.H.E. is carrying out urgent works of military importance such as Hospital Town Water Supply and Drainage scehem at Aundh etc. These wwroks are of a temporary nature.It is for consideration whether the C.P. H.E. may be informed that his office cannot be raised to the status of A S.E. .If he is given the powers of a S.E. he will obviously have to be given the pay of a S.E.

think
I this ED Ct.
E/W

5. Point (B) .In view of the urgent need of fet-renchement in expeneiture Poona Water Works Dn. and Dapuri Workshops were reconstituted into sub-dns. and w were placed under the C.P.H.E. with effect from the 1

from the 1-12-1953.The sub-dn. is now held by —
Gadrk. The C.P.H.E. states that the volume as measured
in H &F. expenditure and the total revenue of the Poona Kirkee
Water Works is more now than when it was a division.If it is
decided not now than when it was a division.If it is (I agree dt. 4/9 Sd/- 31-8-45
decided not to grant the powers of the S.E. to the C.P.
H.E. the question of converting the poona water wroks
Sub-dn. into a Dn. under him does not arise as he
exercises the powers of an Ex-engr.
ID. 31.8.43.

I consider that no change in the status of the C.O.H.E. is called for at present. The Poona water works are being run efficiently by a S.Dn. - a fairly senior experienced hand can always be had for this concentrated work which is now a well organised routine work only.

2. The C.P.H.E. is an officer for consultation is thus a specialist. His status need not , therefore be compared with that of the other deppt. officers.

3. This question has been throughly gone into ever since the creation of the post of the C.P.H.E. The present C. P H. E. is taking over executive work which has to be and can be done by the local Exec. Engr. The Poona Water Works can be placed in the D.C. if ahar at all necessary as it was before and the C P.H.E. lighteded.

The public Health Branch of the P.W.D. has been re constituted on the recommendation of the Reorganisation Committe with effect from the 1st March 1933 and the duties assigned to the C.P.H.E are stated in para 3 of G.R. P.W.D No. 6961/27 dated 3-2-34. The P.H.E. Br. as per these orders is intended to be a consultant one for P.H. Works.

2. As pointed out in the O.M. the C.P. H.E. raised in the post the question of giving him the status of a supdg.Engr but after full considerating Govt. saw no reason to do so.Even now there seems no reasons to alter the policy laid down after mature consideration merely the ground that due to conditions arising from the war, there is at present a temporary increase of work in the

increase of work in the division.It is true that several works of Water Supply and drainage pertaining mainly to the Mily Deptt. are at present under ex execution round about Poona.But such increase of work has occured in several other Dns. also viz. the Presidency, Thana Poona, Ahmedabad etc. may add that due to difficulty of getting materials such as cement,pipes etc. The execution of a number of Mun.l Schemes isnt present held in abyyance.If they had been taken upfor execution the C.P.H.E . would have been required to inspect them.To this extent his work has been lighted.

3. However in order to relieve the C.P.H.E. of the heavy Executive and other ex work either of the following two courses can be adopted.

1. Out of the five Sub-Dns. at present under the C.P.H.E. two may be transferred to other Dns.

a) The Poona Water Works Sub.Dns. which looks after the maintenance and repairs of the existing Poona Cantonment,Kirkee andother Water Works may be transferred to the Poona Irrigan. and Research Dn.

b) The Ambernath Water Supply Sub.Dn. may be transferred to theThana South Dn- in which jurisdiction the works in this sub-dn-are situated.

ii) The present P.H. Branch may be asplit up into two Dnl. charges.

a) The Consultant Branch

b) TheExecutive.

and each branch be placed in charge of one Ex. Engr. Mr. Collett may continue to be in charge of the Consultant Branch, and ashe would be relievedof the Executive work, he could easily carry out the duties assigned to him as per para 3 of G.R. referred to above and of preparin projects for which a seperate Sub.dn. has been formed at his request.The new dn. will be in charge of the following three sub.-dins.....

i) Poona Water Works Sub-dn.

ii) Hospital Town Water Suppl Sub-Dn.

III) Ambernath Water Supply Sub dn.

The execution of works in the Executive dn. may be subject to the procedure laid down in para 4 (d) of the G.R. of 1934 referred to above.

I consider that the second alternative would be more suitable as it would give greater relief to the C.P.H.E. to enable as it would give grea ter relief to be C.P.H.E. to enable him to devote greater attention to his normal duties as a Government consultant.

4. It will be seen that the necessity of creating an addnl. Dnl. charge will be for a short period only, as the pressure of Milly works would cease with the cessation of the war. In normal times, there should be no difficulty to follow the policy and procedure laid down in the G.R. of 1934.

ID. 13.10.43.

I am personally convinced that this proposal is fully justified and that it will lead both to better and more efficient war work for the present and for the future to far reaching improvement in post war reconstruction and nation-building activities. In fact, for reasons I have given on files indicating the necessity for a larger assignment of direct work to Mr. ~~Langar~~ Collett, to carry out the very important and successful work he has done under considerable handicaps.

(I think the ~~xx~~ change might well have been made before and would certainly have made it easier for Mr. Collett.)

2. The main objection stated in the P.W.D. notings are:-

i) The Consulting Public Health Engineer's work is intended to be and has been consultative ~~advice~~ as laid down in the G.H. of 1934 when the post was reduced to that of Executive Engineer, and nothing has occurred to make a revision of this decision necessary, especially as the matter was re-examined by the late Govt. in 1938 and a proposal to revert to the previous position was thus rejected.

ii) That the increase in the work is temporary and will disappear when the war is over. Besides owing to the policy of avoiding all works which are not inescapable war fund schemes which would otherwise have ~~been~~ been undertaken have been postponed and to this extent the work has been lessened.

iii) If however some relief is required it should be by way of handing over some of the work in his charges to other Engineers or by splitting his post and assigning some works now under hi to a newly created Executive Engineer.

3. Dealing with (i), it is worth while to trace the history of this appointment in brief. The recommendation of the Reorganisation Committee was:-

"~~In~~ the past it has been the policy to entrust the execution of public health works, such as water supply and town drain-age schemes, to they public health engineering department which was consequently working in the

.....

in the same area in which there was already a public works staff. This may be, and probably is, the ideal arrangement, but we do not think that it is one which Government in their present financial situation are able to afford. Having inview the general restriction of public works grant-s, we are informed that the ordinary staff of that department could without argumentation take over both the preparation of plans and the execution of works previously done by the public health engineers, provided that the advise of a specialist officer was available to them when required.

We therefore propose that the posts of superintending engineer, Public health department, and executive engineer, public health works division, and the six sanitary sub-divisions should be abolished and that in their place an appointment of the rank of executive engineer should be created, the holder of which would act primarily in an advisory capacity. The functions of the incumbent should be to advise as to the lines in which public health projects should be prepared, to scrutinise such projects before their submission to Government and to inspect them during the courses of construction giving such advise to the officers in charge of the construction as might be necessary.

(It will be seen that the committee proposed abolition of the electric Engineer as well, but luckily we did not do this)

Accepting this the orders of Govt. were :.

" 3. The following duties are asigned to the Consulting Public Health Engineer to Government .

a) To act as consulting Engineering to Govt. in connection with all public Health Works which may be inaugurated by the Government.;

b) To scrutinise and report on all Public Health Produce projects, prepared by outside agencies, which are submitted to government for approval by local or outside bodies.;

c) To act, when required, and with the approval of government, as consulting engineer to local and outside bodies in any Public Health matter: the terms, laid down in paragraph 6 below, shall apply in each case"....

Later on, not mentioned in P.W.D. noting under G.M. P.W.D. No. 1731/36. of 12th April 1939, the Poona Water Supplying works division and the Dapuri Workshops Division ~~andcthe~~ were converted into sub-divisional charges and givenover to the consulting Public Health Engineer. To this extent his purely consultative position was modified and his work was made executive though this rightly was not then accepted as a reas n to reconstitute him as a superintending engr. .

The Consulting Public Health Engr. futherpoints out that he has been given the work previously done by the Boring Engineer.

4. I need not again not again labour at length the point I have made on other files at various times that we should return as much as possible to the position before 1934 when the Consulting Public Healt Engineer both initiated and carried out schemes. This was to some extent accepted at the time, both in the case of Sholapur filtration scheme in regards to whic A(F) stated that this should not be regarded as a prec cedent since if so it would involve return to status of Superintending Engineer, and the more so when Go agreed to the apointemt under Mr. Collett of a speci project sub-division which to that extent has altered the position of 1934 by which plans and estimates wer to be prepared by the Executive Engineers of the divisions concerned under the guidance of the Consulting Public Health Engineer. (Incidentally the Sholapur decision has been fully justified as it is hoped to supply filtered water by next December, a th which could never have been done in war time under the old system) I have further remarked on the cases of the Dharwar, Hubli and Belgaum water works that the chief reason for doing nothing was this conversio of the post of consulting Public Health Engineer to consultative.

5. I was under the impression at the time though I did not think this, that Sholapur was not an isolated ~~insurance~~ instance as supposed and that Mr. Collett had first initiated and carried out personally several other Local Fund and other project. I have obtained a list of these and it is attached They are (A) works executed for Govt.,
B) works executed for the Military,
C) works executed for Local and Outside Bodies and
D) Boring works.
This list will show these extent to which the position of 1934 has been departed from and that it has for some time really been a complete misnomer to speak of the post as merely consultative.

6. Taking the sub-lists in order many oef the Govt works are of course in connection with the Poona water works which are the consulting Public Health Engineer's direct charge. Even deducting this and war works it is clear that there is a number of works of the type which will occur in the future e.g. those at Ambernath, Kirkee, Ganeshkhind, Thana and the like.

As to war works for the Military I think it has not been hiterto realised to what extent Mr. Collet has contributed to the war effort in Poona and that he has carried out executively so many important works. The feature of these works is that they have all been undertaken in direct co.operation with or at the direct request of the Military and without any waste of time on obtaining the prior orders of Govt. he has come to Gov. only to obtain routine orders for the levy of centage charges. He could easily have taken the more convenient course of obtaining Govt. orders before agreeing to undertake each work. As it is, he and his staff have been heavily over burden with this work and I think their efforts are beyond praise and a notable example of the fullest and readiest co-operation in the war effort. I referred to this matter in recommending a small honorarium for work done by Mr. Collett and his staff for Messrs. Tatas aerodrome at Poona.

The works done for local Bodies do not represent a substanti-

filtration work at Sholapur is excluded,but as I have noted on other files the consulting public Health Engineer is ready to extend this side of the work as soon as directed and should be allowed to do so now that the project sub-division has been will in fact in my opinion be the only possible course if we are to carry through such large wofks as the water works at Belgaum and Hubli Dharwar and other big projects under the 10 lakhs subsidy scheme.

7. I think the second objection mentioned in para. 2 has been largely met by what has already been stated above. In fact the contrary will certainly be the case.The ordinary district staff under Executive Engineers will be more than fully engaged with the arrears of works approved but hitherto postponed as 'escapable' .If we are at all to implement the the "10 lakhs' subsidy scheme when materials and labour are available and to carry out that part of post war reconstruction which relates to large water and drainage works for mofussil areasm direct work by the Consulting Public Health Engineer will be axiomatic.

8. The consultation should be therefore, the work of the consulting Public Health Engr. has vastly chagged since Mr. Collett took over. It has long been mainly executive and he has for a long time been handicapped by insufficient status and powers.I am compelled in fact to state that the Deptt. has in my opinion taken a very short sighted view of the matter.The sooner we rectify the mistakes of the past, the better.

9. As to the third objectionin para. 2 I considered whether it would suffice if the con. Public Health Engr. was made a supdg. Engr. and the poona

handed over to another Executive Engr. e.g.Poona Irrigation and Research Divn. so as to avoid creating another Ex. Engr. charge. I consulted Mr. Collett about this and he has convinced me that it would be a mistake.The Poona waterworks used to be a divisional charge.They are being increasingly used and bringing in an increasingly large revenue. Mr. Collett tells me he has to be there at least twic a week to see that all is well. He further pointed out that it would be bad, not to say, foolish policy to take away the supervision from the officer who is the real authority on water works. With present condition the increased cost of conversion from a sub-divisional to a divisional charge will be a small proportion of the revenue.

10. The cost in Mr. Collet'd case would be the difference between his present (including overseas) pay and allowances viz. Rs 1,750, and the pay of a specialist supd.engr. viz. Rs 2,150 as drawn by the Electrical Engr. Mr. Higham, and I think it is a small amount com-pared with the vast increase in effeciency and future out turn of work.I may add that Mr. Collett himself is more anxious to obtain the means of increased efficiency than in regard to pay.On the other hand I think it is clear that both status and pay have been long overdue.

A possible objection to this is that Mr. Collett is already under extension and will shortly leave us, but it has been made clear above that the nature of the post as justifying the change will not alter.I understand that Mr. Collett will be fit enough to do another Year's work,if extended again, and though this not the occasion to comment on that I think the opportunity should not be lost. Again for the future, it will probably a great mistake to fill the vacancy by promotion in the department and a sufficiently qualified expert should be obtainedby advertising for the post that the pay can produce.

11, The papers will now have to go to F.D. in the first instance.

Sec. P.W.D. ID. 25-10-43.

F.D.

u.o.r. to the F.S. dated the 26th Oct. 1943 with F.P noted on the

Finance Department.

The two points for consideration afre:-

1) whether the post of consulting Public Health Engineer should be converted into a superintending Engineer's post and(2) if so, what pggy scale should be fixed for the new post.

2. Dealing with (i) first it is necessary to trace the history of the C.P.H.E.'s post. This has been done in the P.W.D. office note at pp. 59-67 in file No. 1731/36. The salient facts are:-

Prior to 1933 the Public Health Branch was uder a superintending Engineer who looked two Divisions and six sub-divisions. This branch prepared all plans and estimates and also executed all P.H. works of Government and local Bodies.

3. On the recommendation of the Reorganisation Committee the P.H. Branch was reconstituted and made primarily consultative. The executive work was entrusted to the Ex. Engrs. of the ordinary P.W.D. Dns. and some of the P.H. staff was transferred to these Dns. to cope with this work. The Head of the P.H.Br. was styled C.P.H.E. and was given the status of an Ex. Engr. Four Officers filled this post before Mr.Collett was appointed to it on 29.11.38. From 1-12-38, the purely consultative character of the post was changed because the Poona Water Works Dn. and the Dapuri workshops were constitued into Sub-dns. and placed under the C.P.H.E. But it is important to note that for this extra work, he was sanctioned in addn a sp. pay of Rs 100 p.m. (vide para 7 of Secy. P.W.D note at P. 75 in P.W.D. file No. 2455/36 and the noting on P. 86 of the same file)

4. In 1939 Mr. Collett's request to be made a Superintending Engineer was refused by Govt. (vide Para 2 of the P.W.D. note at p. 5 ante)

With this background of the history of this post it will now be possible to examine the arguments for and

and against the proposal to reconvert the post of C.P.H.E. into a Superintending Engineer's post. The argument in favour of the proposal are:-

1) The purely consultative nature of the appointment has been changed by the addition of executive duties, especially the following:-

a) The two sub-dns. transferred to the C.P.H.E. from 1-12- 38.

b) Work previously done by the Boring Engineer.

c) Special project sub-dn. for plans and estimates

d) Execution of may works for Local Bodies e.g. the Sholapur project.

2) The Consulting Engineer has been executing many important Military works.

3. As a matter of policy we should return as much as possible t o the position before 1934 when the C.P.H.E. both initiated and carried out shhemes. The constitution of a project sub-dn under Mr. Collett lends support to this policy, and the works of local Bodies will be accelaerated by the adoption of this policy.

5. These arguments are discussed below :-

1) The addition of the few excutive duties is not by itself sufficient ot make this ppost as important as one of Superintending Engineer, For (a) the C.P.H.E. has been granted a sp. pay of Rs 100p.m. and this is really the only specific addition to his work by way of executive duties. b) Boring works seem to be of a very minor character. The expenditure in 1942-43 was only Rs 14,614(vide Diggram furnished by C.P.H.E.) (c) does not appear to involve many executive duties, since it appear to involve many ~~mcutive~~ duties since it means only the preparation of plans and estimates. Presumably this sub-dn. is adequately staffed, and the work of the C.P.H.E. himself must therefore be mostly advisory in the matter of preparation of plans and estimates. As for item (d) it is clear that the Sholapur came was an exception and in the words of H.E. 'need not be regarded as creating a precedent' (p. 21 of P.W.D. file No. 5952/36). A (R) also writes "The works done for local bodies do not represent a substantial cost, if the filtration work at Sholapur is excluded' (p. 14 ante).

Rs 1875/-
The pay scales for Superintending Engineers are:-

1) For I.S.E. Officers Rs 1750-100-2150

2) For Provincial Service Officers:-

Old Scale Rs 1450-75-1750

New Scale Rs 1100-50-1300

Mr. Collett is not an I.S.E. Officer. Neither is he an officer appointed by the Secretary of State. He is appointed by and is under the rule making control of this govt. who can terminate his agreement on six months notice (vide p. 67, P.W.D. file no. 2455/36.)

On promotion as Superintending Engineer Mr. Mr. Collett would under the rules be entitled to the revised scale for Superintending engineers namely, 1100-50-1300, and since the maximum of this is less than his present pay he would remain on his present pay even as a superintending engineer, he is not an I.S.E. Officer and therefore is not entitled to the I.S.E. scale for Superintending Engineers. Even if on the analogy of Mr. Higham's case Mr. Collett is granted the I.S.E. is granted the I.S.E. scale of 1750-100-2150 for Superintending Engineers as a special case, he can be given only Rs 1750 + £13-6-8(178 Rs) O.S.P = Rs1928 . He would of course drop his special pay of Rs 100 p.m. The proposal of A(H) to start Mr. Collett on Rs2150 cannot be accepted as it would amount to the grant of four advance increments even in the I.S.E. Scale. The sanctioning of the I.S.E. scale would itself be a concession and there does not appear to be any justification to grant advance increments (vide S.C.S.R. 51).

The specialist post of C.P.H.E. and of S.E.s are in the provincial service (vide pp.57-62 F.P. No.II)

9. The case is for orders.

Jt. Secy. SN 3/12

I agree with H.S. and have not much to add to his note-

2. The Reorganisation Committee are no doubt prepared to concede that it was probably the ideal arrangement that the Public Health Engineering Deptt. should execute works which it initiated; but a time, such as the present of acute shortage of technical staff and of restriction of works to the inescapable minimum seems hardly the appropriate---

appropriate one for introducing the ideal.I may mention here that the "10 lakhs' subsidy scheme as at present budge ted for, ends in 1944 -45 Its continuance for the rest of the war ~~am~~ during post war reconstruction remains to be settled.As for Military works, several Executive Engineers have no doubt shared the consdderable war effort of P.W.D.The Presidency Division with its numerious 'A.R.P. and some importang Military works is a notable example.Poona and Thana are other examples.Yet the magnitude of this effect is of course no reason for the conversion of these posts into those of Superintending Engineers.

3 The total cost of Military and ordinary works must be ~~bbbb

Poona Water Works and the Dapuri Workshops and he thus is quite unaware either of the difficulties that an Ex. Engr.in the P.W.D. is called upon to face or the amount of work that he is called upon to do, nor has he been so situated that it has not been possible for him to take his cases up to his S.E. and explain them personally; that officer has then dealt with Govt.Mr.Collett now appears to imagine that if he is granted full powers of S.E. he willno longer have to worry with Govt. and the Red tape he reveres to in the final paragraph of his note on p. 8 of the loose papers slipped 4 This would certainly not be the case...

This at least renders it doubtful whe ther the conversion of the C.P.H.E. 's post into one of superintending Engr is going to have the effect claimed

5. For the various reasons appearing above F.D. must in my opinion oppose the proposal.

6. As regards the effect of the proposed conversion on Mr. Collett's pay, I agree that the position is as stated* by U.S.

ID. 5/12/-

*. ... the fps on page 19 ante

U.O.R. to the P.W.D. dtd. 6.12.43.

Addl.---

Although the F.D. noting states ably and concisely the objections taken to this proposal in the past and those which could be taken to it ongeneral grounds, it does not in my opinion in any way controvert my arguments in its favour and I feel it is my duty to press for it strongly.

2. I endeavoured to show, perhaps inddequately, firstly that the change of designation to Ex. Engr was made because it was to be consultative in future whereas, by gradual and insensible development it has now become far more executive than consultative and secondly that, both in regafd to his present work and the work which will inevitably fall upon him in the future, the C.P.H.E.

is definitely handicapped in not being of S.E.'s status. A on Page 26

3. Little advantage will be gained by dealing with the F.D. arguments extensively. I would only observe.:-

i) It is surely as clear as anything could be that though on paper the 10.lakhs subsidy ceases in 1944.45 it will have to be continued and even increased later.In addition to that Govt. is faced with the construction of water works at Dharwar and Belgaum.

(ii) I did not expect to be faced with my own opinion on other files as to the increase of expenditure in various Divisions run by Ex. Engrs. That is surely an increase in volume and not in nature of work and such work cannot be compared with that of an expert planning and executing large drainage and water works beyond the capacity of the ordinary Ex. Engr. Incidentally the argument is an admission that the C.P.H.E.'s work is now mainly executive. Para 7 of U. Secy F.D's note

iii) Surely the argument in para 6 of U Secy's note is for the same rreason illogical.It is based on increase or decrease in executive work whereas the whole basis of the argument for the proposal is that the C.P.H.E. is doing executive work at least as heavy as that done before his status was altered and the change to XN was made because he was no longer to do executive works.

iv) Mr. Hammett's note quoted by Jt.Secy.was written some years ago, whereas the point is that the position of the C.P.H.E. has changed vastly since that time.

4. I take it the main argument adduced against is A(F)'s view referred to in para 7(3) of U Secy.F.D. 8s note.

I tried to show that probably the real change in Mr. Collett works was not sufficiently known at that time and I certainly was not at that time sufficiently experienced in P.W.D. affairs to be aware of it. Aprat from that we have advanced considerably even since that time and have to view these matters from a post war angle.It will of course be for A(F) to say how far he accepts this.

5. Taking therefore the long view,I am convinced that both from the point of view of the present position and also that of future...

future planning it is very desirable to recognise the change position of the C.P.H.E. and to give him an adequate status and powers. It is not a case of waiting till the end of the war and we should begin now to build up the necessary establishment and machinery.

6. I did not go into the matter before but so far as I am aware, all the larger Provinces i.e. Punjab U.P. Bengal and Madras have C.E.s or S.E.s Bengal and Madras In Madras he is styled Sanitary Engineer but draws pay of Rs 1750 But this argument may not be convincing since the higher posts in our P.W.D. are noticeably less in number by comparison with other large Provinces in fact I think we have suffered heavily by misdirected retrenchment. At the same time it is an argument for building up personal for the future.

7. The question of the C.P.H.E. pay if he became S.E. is of subsidiary importance, but I would say that having regard to Mr. Collett's ages and long service a pay of less than Rs 2150 would be inequitable.

8. Although he may not wish to express an opinion on the proposal, I think perhaps A(E) should see, as so much of C.P.H.E.'s work comes under C.D.

A(E) I am glad to have seen these papers but would prefer not to express an opinion.

Dy 11/12/-

A(F)

I think that position needs clarification.

2. I agree that during the last year or so Mr.Collett has been doing work which is executive as well as consulting and that the case whether he ought not to be made a S.E. was for consideration (As a matter of fact it was considered and turned down)

3. But I am not clear what are the actual executive works which it is considered Mr. Collett will be doing from now on. I as yet see no reason to change my previous view that very few, if any, large Bombay Govt.P.H.works c executed or even started during the war and I do not know

know that we have information as to the further Defence Dept. P.H. works which Mr.Collett will be expected to execute in 1945-46.

4. If there are no or few such works, Mr.Collett will be employed on mxx advising local bodies(which equally will not be able to carry out any big work) and in planning for Govt. work which it may be intended provisionally to carry out after the war

Whether Mr.Collett will be doing beyond I doubt the ambit of a Mammix Consulting Engineer and if he does not the case for changing him from a consulting to a superintending Engineer in not obvious.

5. It may of course be professionally improper for a consulting Engineer to supervise the planning of the works which he may suggest. But I doubt whether Govt. would accept wuch a proposition.

6. I agree of course that there may be large projects of post w ar P.H.developments which need to be planned now.But I think we should know in more detail what these are likely to be before deciding whether Mr. Collett must be made an S.E. in charge of their planning.

7. In any case Mr. Collette's health is bad. He is I think on extension, and I should very greatly doubt his lasting till we can get an expert office r to succed him as S.E.P.H after the war.

8. I should be inclinded to xxxxx wage that Mr.Collett will have to leave us long before we can get a qualified successor for this S.E.'s post -- this post through Govt.'s kindness of heart and the demand of I.S.E. and B.S.E. not to lose a prise post will be given to an existing member of I.S.E. or B.S.E. with no real qualifications at all, first as a stop gap, than permanently on the ground of not recruiting an outsider.The result of promoting Mr.Collett now to S.E. will thus be to saddle Govt with an expensive post in which an incompetant will liberate while our post war P.H. plans go to naught through lack of efficiency

9

9. I agree we must build up as A(R)(s para. 7 says personnel for the futurem but we shall not be doing that by appointing

appointing an officer who on all probabilities may go sick on us and with the prospect of his being succeeded by an entirely non-expert.

10. Apart from thedesirability of rewarding Mr.Collett for past good work, I consider the proposal needs further information and further consideration of its implications before F.D. can accept it.

11. As regards A(R)'s para 7 I do not know the grounds on which one can say that less pay than £2150 would be inequitable. I think F.D. must ask for further reasons for departing from the normal rule.

A(R) Id 15/12/43

On the question of facts, I think it is clear enough that we have returned to the position which was in force before we lowered the status of the post. On merits Mr. Collett has for some time been doing the same work as a supdg. Engineer did in the past without the pay and status. Government on the other hand has found that the work can go on under an Ex. Engr. without any insurmountable difficulty or detriment to the Public interests and that therefore it is not essential to restore thatstatus whether this is entirely fair to Mr. Collett is open to argument I think that he could have done better work still, had he possessed the status. He has got over the difficulty by (fortunately in the war time) anticipating government sanction and sometimes exceeding his powers and inviting mildcensures from P.W.D. Secretariat.

2. As to A(F)'s para 6, I see no objection and this was the position in the time of Mr.Maddocks. It would be quite easy to drop theword Consultative if practical necessity demanded.

3. As to A(F)'s para. 4 I have no doubt that Military drainage and water works will continue to the same extent so long as the war lasts. But that was the weakest part of the argument in favour. It was used---

It was used only to show the extent to which Executive now dwarf Consultative work. The main point must be whether the change is necessary now for future planning and for Local Fund water and drainage works which may be started in the comparatively near future. I did not attach the files, but I believe it has been decided that Government shall construct the hugh water works at Belgaum and Dharwar-Hubli and and that the earth work shall start as soon as possible. If so, these are works for a real expert. As to A of A(F)'s note, I sincerely hope the future importance of skilled personnel will preclude any such possibility either on part or that of a future Government.

4. Nevertheless I am not prepared to press the proposal in view of A(F)'s opinion, since it cannot be stated that we have definietly reached the moment when the public's interest demands it we cannot delay for another moment. Perhaps H.E. should see before the proposal is (temporarily I hope) laid to rest.

5. I think we shall have to examine the question whether Mr. Collett requires assistance in the form of extra staff or relieving him of some of his work apart from the question of change of status.

16-12-43

A(F)

H.E.(G.S.).

I gather from A(H)'s note that there is likely to be a considerable amount of planning for Post-War Reconstruction to be done by Mr. Collett in the near future and pro tanto may doubt as to the advisability of converting this post into that of a superintending Engineer are dued.

2. But I am still very doubtful as to the advisability of the conversion of the Post. I doubt Mr. Collett being able to carry on until we are able to recruit an expert to take his place, If he were to have to leave us and there is a superintending Engineer's post it would be extremely difficulty to avoid filling it. And once an officer has got dug in to the post, it will be still more difficult to avoid confirming him. Any suggestion to appoint a really qualified Officer by recruitment after the war would be faced with a fait accompli in the shape of an unqualified officerr already in possition.

3. It is certain, I think, that we must have an expert especially for the carrying out of large works after the war in the way of drainage and water supply. And if we could rely on Mr. Collett's continuance, I would certainly agree to make his post a Superintending Engineer's one. But, as things stand, I do no think it would be desirable .

4. What we shall have to pay after the war I do no know. The Bombay Water Works Engineer gets Rs 1,800, the Municipal Engineer Rs 1750 to Rs 2,000 and these are reexxmd reduced pays. The Chief Engineer the Municapal Commissioner tells me, used to get Rs 3,000 I rather suspect that the cost of Public Health Engineer to Government after the war may have to be that of a chief Engineer if we are going to get a really good man. I hesitate to conclude that on a superintending Engineer's pay we should get the type of man we need.

5. If the Government of India will agree to release a suitable man from Military or Government of Indian in service now and we could advertise the post with permission

permission for those already in Government services military or civila in any department to apply, I would say make Mr. Collett's post a superintending Engineer's post at once, and advertise for a successor immediately .But I cannot think that Government of India and H.M.G. would agree to this.

5. My own feeling is that the proper solution is to give Mr. Collitee an edequate especial pay either for the Executive (i.e. the not consulting) work which he has been doing and which he apparently will have to do, or for the post War planning which will now fall to his lot.This will avoid any difficulty about advance increments and relaxation of rules.

7. On Mr. Collet's departure, his post can be filled by any Executive Engineer and the post of a chief Engineer or Superintending Engineer.Public Health, Advertisement and an expert obtained.This will avoid any one acquiring a lieu on the Superintending Engineer's post.

Id 17-12-43.

(R) I consider (f)'s suggestion to be excellent, I also agree with his para 2+3 perhaps he would like (f) for the since water and drainage works will be mainly these of total bodies.

18.12.43.

A (C) 18-12-43
A (CE) 20-12-43
E (CS) 24-12-43

* If he completes his full years extension we may believe them have been able to come to a definite decision on the status of the post and be able to advertise before this temporary appointment.

E.E.

These papers relates to the conversion of the post of the C.P.H.E. to that of a S.E.'s post.It hasbeen decided that the above mentioned question should be granted a special pay.His present pay is as under:-

	Rs p.m.
Pay	1,375
spl. pay	100
C.S.P.	400 (@30)
	1,875.

2. There are very few officers in this deptt. who draw special pay.They are mentioned below :-

	Spl. pay Rs
Chief Engr. & Secy. to Govt.	250/-
Dy. Secy.	200/ each
Ex. Engr. presy.dn.	200/-
Mr. Collett C.P H.E. to Govt.	100/-
Asst. or Dy. engrs. attached the secretariat.	50/-

In G.L. No. 5971/36-E dated 1-12-43 an honorarium of 1½ months pay (Rs 2812) has been sanctioned to Mr. Collett for work of water supply to the Air Craft Factory Poona.

3. It is for orders what further special pay may be given to Mr. collett.

Id. 8/1/44.

Looking up the list of special pays drawn by other officers in the P.W.D. I am inclined to the view that th C.P.H.E. may be granted a specialpay of Rs 225/- p.m. for the reasons stated in para 6 of the A(F's) note on page 38.Mr. collett is at present drawing a special pay of Rs 100/- p.m. and if Govt. sanction an increase of Rs 125/- (enhanced special pay then would be Rs 225/- p.m.)Mr. Collett would draw Rs 2,000/- p.m. (Rs 1,875/- as drawn by at present vide para 1 of the office note above plus Rs 125/- of additional special pay) If govt. agree the a may be given effect to from 1-1-1944.

2. Govt. orders are solicited in the matter....

ID. Xmas. 11/1/44.
Jt Secy FD 12-1-44
A(R)

A(F)

H.E.(G.S)

I agree.

2. I have since seen Mr. Collett, who was a s before not so anxious about pay as status. I think however, he will welcome this as a recognition of the arduous executive work he is doing especially 'war' work which incidentally is bringing in a substantial amount in the form of centage charges so long as the Govt. of Inida agree to pay them.

3. I explained to him that we could not make him a S.E. and he raised two points:-

1) Could we give him all or some of the powers of a S.E. without raising status? At present he is administratively under the S.E. D.I.C. He refered in particular to (a) inspection of his office (b) sending report through him. I gather that the former is usally very formal, as in the case of this year's inspection by Mr. Mammett but he feels it might be more detailed in futmre As to (b) I believe che does usually consult direct with Government and this to the good.

ii) About assistance in respect of staff He seemed to have gathered from a present discussion with A(E) when he inspected the Poona water works that we were contemplating assistance in the form of taking these and other water works out of his charge, He was concer-ned about this and would prefer to do the extra work without help than to loose them. I agree that it would be wrong to take thise important works out of the hands of the recognised water works experts. He asked if we could raise the status of the Poona Water Works sub- division to a divisions on the understanding that the Executive Engineer selected would be given other outlying waw-ater works e.g. AAlandi and Badlapur. I think water this would be desirable. The present revenue from them is very large and supervision ftakes up a lot of his time. It would not entail ftaking away a man from the depleted P.W.D. staff as he was a man in his department suitable for the post.

4. If A(F) agree that we might explore these two suggestions will do so. 13.1.44, H.E agrees to the increased sp pay.

Sl. No.	Nature of power	S.Es powers.	C.P.H.Es powers	Addn;Secy's And Secy's orders.
1.	Power to sanction tempy. and work charged estabts.	The S.Es. of Circles exercise the power to sanction temporary and work charged estabt. upto Rs 250 p.m. in each individual case subject to the conditions mentioned against serial No2 in col.5 of App.XXVII of the Bombay P.W.D.Manual Vol.II.	The C.P.H.E. possesses the power to sanction tempy. and work charged estts. upto Rs 100 p.m. in each individual case subject to the same conditions as in the case of S.Es.	
2.	Power to vary details of tempy. estabt.	The S.Es. have been given the powers to vary details of tempy.estabts. in their own offices and in those of the subdte.officers subject to the same conditions as are laid down in respect of their powers to make apptts. on tempy. estabt.	The C.P.E. has no powers in this respect.	
3.	Power to waive the ruling which requires that work charged estabt.should be employed on specific work.	The S.Es. possess ful powers to the condition that the S.Es. should determine the proportions in which the cost of estabt. should be allocated between the works concerned in consultation with the Audit Officer.	---------do--------	

Srl. No.	Nature of power	S.Es powers.	C.P.H.E's powers.
	Power to fix the amount of security.	The S.Es possess ful powers in regard to store keepers, membersofs the S.S.E.,their own head clerks,surveyors, signallers in charge of Govt stores,water rate collectors and D'men having in their charge mathematical instruments and drawing materials.	The C.P.H.E. has full powers in regard to karkuna, maistries and members of petty,plantation and revenue estabt. entrusted with the custody of cash or stores.
5.	Power to grant C.A.to the members of the work-charged estabt.	The S.Es. are authorised to grant conveyance allowances ~~xxxxxxxxx~~ at the rates,on the conditions mentioned in sub-clause(iv) of clause(c) of para. 92 of the Bombay P.W.D. Manual Vôlx I, to the members of the work-charged estabt.with the exception of overseers,if the conveyance is considered necy- for the efficient performance of their duties.	The C.P.H.E. has not been authorised to excercise this power.
	Power to fix the starting pays of overseers on the tempy.and work-charged estabt. higher than the pays admissible under the rules.	In Govt. Memo No.4126/36-E, dated the16/4/41 and the 29-10-41 the S.Es have been authorised to fix the starting pays of overseers on tempy. and work charged estabts., higher than the pays arrived at in accordance with the orders contained in G.R.No. 7546/27,dated the 28-6-35, subject to the maximum limit	TheC.P.H.E. does not posses this power.

Srl. No.	Name of power.	S.Es.powers.	C.P.H. Es powers.	Addnl.Secy's and Secy's orders.
6.		contd. limit of Rs100 p.m. in the case of graduates in Engrg. and Rs 70 p.m. in the case of Diploma Holders, the temp. and work charged overseers in such cases are not granted any increment in pay or be promoted to the pt.estabt without the orders of Govt.		
7.	Power to allot funds for minor works under 60-C.W. from disc;grant.	The S.Es, have powers to allot funds upto a limit of Rs 50,000 in each case from the disc;grant placed at their disposal by the P.W.D. after the works are administratively approved and plans and estimates therefore are technically sanctioned by competent authority(Srl.No. 17 in App. XXVII to the P.W.D. Manual Vol. II).	The C.P.H.E's name is not mentioned in the Appt.but he exercises the same powers as S.Es. as provision for disc-grant is entirely at his disposal.	
8.	Power to sell or demolish Provl.Civil or Irrign.Bldg. A)due to their being in a dangerous condition or cost repair.	The S.Es. have got powers upto Rs 2,000 in each case subject to certain conditions, vide Srl.No.24 in App.XXVII to the P.W.Manual.	The C.P.H.E.has got this power upto Rs500 in each case, subject to the same conditions.	
	b) for other reasons.	The S.Es. have got powers upto Rs 500 in each case subject to certain conditions vide Srl.No. 24 in App.XXVII, to the P.W.D. Manual.	The C.P.H.Es has no power.	
	Power to change the mos-			

Srl.No.	Nature of power	S.Es powers	C.P.H.Es powers	Addnl.Secy's.Secy's orders
9.	Power to change the nomenclature of bldgs.	The S.Es,have got full powers.	---do-	
10.	Power in connection with alternative utilisation of Provl. Bldgs. which are not required for the purpose for which they were originally constructed- 1) Utilisation of Provl. residence for non-residential purposes.			
	2)Alternative utilisation of other Provl.bldgs.	---do--Rs50,000----do---	--do--	
11.	Power to sanction the renting of ordinary office accomodation:- 1)When the accomodation is provided in a separate building.	The S.Es. have powers upto the limit of Rs 100 p.m.	The C.P.H.E. has no power.	
	ii)When the accomodation is provided in a bldg partly used as a private residence.	The S.Es. have powers upto onehalf of the total rent subject to a maximum of Rs.50 month.	---- do----	
12.	Power to writeoff- 1)Irrecoverable value of public money etc.	The S.Es have got powers upto Rs 1,000 in each case subject tocertain conditions,vide Srl. No31(1) in App. XXVII to the P.W.D. Manual.	---do---	

Srl.No.	Name of power.	S.Es.powers.	C.P.W.Es powers.	Addnl. Secy's and Secy.'s orders.
12 contd.	ii)Live stock a) on account of death on account of incapacity for further work of a Veterinary surgeon.	The C.E.s have full powers.	--do--	
	iii)Losses on account of the collapse of bldgs. or structures owing to natural causes(i.e. old age) and their removal from returns of Bldgs.	The S.Es. powers are limited to Rs 500 in each case.	--do--	
13.	Power to sanction rent for store houses.	The S.Es have this power upto Rs 20 p.m.	The C.P.W.E. has got this power upto Rs50 p.m.	
14.	Power to sanction rent statements for residential and non-residential bldgs.	The C.Es. have full powers subject to certain conditions vide Srl.No.35 in App. XXVII to the P.W.D. Manual.	The C.P.W.E. has no power.	
15.	Power to accord technical sanction to original and revised estimates.	The S.Es. are competent to accord technical sanction upto Rs50,000 in the case of original civil works.	The C.P.W.E's power to accord technical sanction is limited to Rs 10,000 in the case of original civil works.	

Srl N^{O}.	Name of Power.	S.Es' powers.	C.P.H.Es powers	Addnl.Secy's and Secy's orders.
16.	Power to accord technl.sanction to P.H.Works.	The S.Es.powers are upto Rs 25,000 to accord technical sanction to original and revised estimates.	The C.P.H.E is competent to accord technl. sanction to original and revised estimates upto Rs 5,000.	
17.	Power to accept tenders.	The S.Es have got powers to accept tenders upto Rs 5,00,000	The C.P.H.E. is authorised to accept tenders upto Rs 50,000.	

Poona Water Works Division.

Estabt.	No. of posts.	Scale of pay Rs	Av. cost p.m. Rs
Ex.Engr.	1	S.S.E. Class I	625
Accountant	1	80-8-200-20/5-225.	159
Head clerk.	1	115-5-160	146
Clerk.	1	95-5-115	111
Clerks	2	70-5-95	174
Clerks	3	25-5/2-65	141
Store-keeper	1	40-4-80-5/2-120	72
Draftsman	1	90-5/2-140	115
Clerk	1	95-5-110	111
Clerks	2	70-5-95	174
Clerk	1	25-5/2-65	47
Cashier	1	70-5/2-95	87
Time-keepers	2	25-5/2-65	94
Asst. Store Keeper.	1	25-5/2-65	47
Delivery Clerk.	1	25-5/3-75	82
Asst.D'man	1	50-5/2-90	73
Tracer	1	25-2-55-3-70	47
Naik	1	20	20
Peon	1	19	19
Peon	1	18	18
Daftary	1	25	25
Peons	2	18 each	36
Peons	2	at 17 each	34
Boy peon	1	10 each	10
Chowkidar	1	13	13
Total av. cost p.m.			Rs 2,434.

Av. per annum Rs 29,208 say Rs 29,000

Poona Water Works Sub-Divn.

Estabt.	No. of posts.	Scale of pay Rs	Av. cost p.m. Rs
Dy. Engr.	2	S.S.E. Class I	310
Cashier	1	70-5/2-95	87
Asstt. store-keeper.	1	25-5/2-65	47
clerks	2	70-5-95	174
	3	25-5/3-65	126
Tracer.	1	25-2-55-3-70	47
Time-keepers	2	25-5/2-65	94
Deliver clerk.	1	25-5/3-75	82
Peons	9 at Rs 18 each		54
	3 at Rs 17 each		51
Boy peon	1 at Rs 12 each		12
Total av. cost p.m. Rs			1,044

Av. cost per annum = 12,528.
say Rs 13,000

E.S.

Resubmitted after issue, with ref. to the note of the A(R) within.

2. The questions under consideration are as follows:-

a) Delegation of all or some of the power of a S.E. to the C.P. H.E.

b) Raising the status of the Poona Water Works Sub-dn-into a Dn. by entrusting to the Ex. Engr. the out lying water works e.g. Alandi and Sadhapur.

3. Point (a) : As Mr. Collett has been granted an addnl. special pay of Rs 125 p.m. vide G.L. No. No.2455/36-E dated the 22nd -1-44 instead of the status of the S.E. It is presumed that full powers of a S.E. are not to be delegated to him. It is accordingly for consideration what powers mentioned in the statement within may be delegated to Mr. Collett personally as C.P.H.E. in consultation with the F.D.

4. Point (b) Please see para 5 of the O.M. dated the 31-8-43. If the Poona Water Works Sub-Dn. is converted into a Dnl. charge, it appears that it will be under the C.P.H.E in view of the portion "A" of the note of the A(R) within. If it is decided to consider the proposal favourably a post of an eEx.Engr. in the B.S.E. class I in the Genl Provl. Service will have to be created. A statements showing the estabt in the Poona water works sub-dn. and that existed in the Poona Water Works Sub.dn before abolition is put up within. It appears that the estab. whichexisted in the PDona water workds Dn. bfoe before abilition willhas to be sanctioned. The extra cost involved will be Rs 16,00 per annum. It however, appears that some staff can be transferred from the office of the C.P.H.E. t the Poona Water Works Dn. and the extra cost mentioned ab will be reduced accordinly.

I think....

4/17-2-44

I think it would be advisable to leave the position as it is,now that the extra pay has been sanctioned for Mr. Collett.

It has, on these papers, already been decided not to make the C.P.H.E. and S.E. and in view of that decision I would not recommend that Mr.Collett either personally or as C.P.H.E. be granted any of the powers of a S.E. Mr.Collett seems to imagine that if he had the powers of a S.E. he would be gree to do as he limed he has long had such ideas, which are quite wrong and in fact in most instances a S.E.'s powers are similar but somewhat greater than those Mr. Collett possess as an E.E. and if trouble is to be avoided either immediately or in the future; it is advisable to keep an administrative check on Mr.Collett 's actions.

If it is considered necessary to make the P.W.Works Sub.Division into a Division, the need for which I am afraid I do not see It would have to come under the S.E. D.I.C. as one E.E.could not be put under another one,and this proposal I gather Mr. Collett does not desire in addition I do not consider that any of the men serving under the sede so many of the seniors in the B.S.E-

* C.P.H.E. are fit to be made Ex.Engrs. as to supercede de many of their seniors in the B.S.E.

I D. 3/3/44

A9R) Although I do not fully agree with the second para of addl.secy's note we have to leave matters as they are in to the cases until C.P.H.E's raises them, when the implication can be discussed with him.The situation may ha arise if his posttion be difficult in a as to S.E.

As to making the Poona Water Works a division I still consider the change a heavy one, or rather considering C.P.H.E's total work. I however agree to the addl difficulty of having one X.N under another, though I do not think A necessity plans.

ID. 6/3/44

Note. for raising the states G.E P.HE to S.E. please see file No.7191/36

12.10.44 A.B and M.B. tpo please see and return 9.3.44

Maridas